

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**
9 **CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**
10

11
12 VICKI ALLEN, an individual,
13 Plaintiff,

14 v.

15 CITY OF PASADENA POLICE
16 DEPARTMENT, a government
17 entity; and COUNTY OF LOS
18 ANGELES WOMEN'S JAIL
19 FACILITY, a government entity;
20 Diego Duran Jara, individually,
21 jointly, severally, and in his official
22 capacity as a City of Pasadena Police
23 Officer; Matthew Morgan,
24 individually, jointly, severally, and in
25 his official capacity as a City of
26 Pasadena Police Officer; and DOES 1
27 through 100, inclusive,
28 Defendants.

Case No.
2:23-cv-08816-MWF-PVCx

STIPULATED PROTECTIVE
ORDER

24 ///

26 ///

27 ///

1 1. INTRODUCTION

2 1.1 PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

3 Discovery in this action is likely to involve production of confidential,
4 proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public
5 disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may
6 be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the Court to
7 enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this
8 Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to
9 discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends
10 only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment
11 under the applicable legal principles. The parties further acknowledge, as set forth
12 in Section 12.3, below, that this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to
13 file confidential information under seal; Civil Local Rule 79-5 sets forth the
14 procedures that must be followed and the standards that will be applied when a party
15 seeks permission from the court to file material under seal.

16 1.2 GOOD CAUSE STATEMENT

17 WHEREAS Plaintiff (“Vicki Allen”) is seeking materials and information
18 that Defendants the City of Pasadena (“City”) and the County of Los Angeles
19 (“County”) et al. maintain as confidential, such as personnel files of the police
20 officers involved in this incident, video recordings, audio recordings, other
21 confidential information and documents regarding this incident, and other
22 administrative materials and information currently in the possession of the City and
23 County and which the City and County each believe need special protection from
24 public disclosure and from use of any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation.
25 Plaintiff also seeks official information contained in the personnel files of the police
26 officers involved in the subject incident, the personnel files of the jail facility staff
27 involved in the subject incident, which the City and/or County maintain as strictly
28 confidential and which the City and/or the County believe need special protection

1 from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this
2 litigation.

3 Defendants assert that the confidentiality of such documents and information
4 sought by Plaintiff are recognized by California law, as evidenced inter alia by
5 California *Penal Code* section 832.7 et seq., California *Evidence Code* section 1040,
6 et seq. and rights to privacy;

7 The City has not publicly released the documents and information referenced
8 above except under protective order or pursuant to court order, if at all. These
9 materials and information are of the type that has been used to initiate disciplinary
10 action against the City of Pasadena Police Department (“CPPD”) officers, and has
11 been used as evidence in disciplinary proceedings, where the officers’ conduct was
12 considered to be contrary to CPPD policy.

13 The County has not publicly released the documents and information
14 referenced above except under protective order or pursuant to court order, if at all.
15 These materials and information are of the type that has been used to initiate
16 disciplinary action against the County of Los Angeles Jail Facility (“County Jail”)
17 staff, and has been used as evidence in disciplinary proceedings, where the staffs’
18 conduct was considered to be contrary to County Jail policy.

19 Absent a protective order delineating the responsibilities of nondisclosure on
20 the part of the parties hereto, there is a specific risk of unnecessary and undue
21 disclosure by one or many of the many attorneys, secretaries, law clerks, paralegals
22 and expert witnesses involved in this case, as well as the corollary risk of
23 embarrassment, harassment and professional and legal harm on the part of the City
24 of Pasadena Police Department officers and/or the County of Los Angeles Jail
25 Facility staff referenced in the documents and information;

26 The unfettered disclosure of the materials and information, absent a protective
27 order, would allow the media to share this information with potential jurors in the
28 area, impacting the rights of Defendants herein to receive a fair trial.

1 Accordingly, to expedite the flow of information, to facilitate the prompt
2 resolution of disputes over confidentiality of discovery materials, to adequately
3 protect information the parties are entitled to keep confidential, to ensure that the
4 parties are permitted reasonable necessary uses of such material in preparation for
5 and in the conduct of trial, to address their handling at the end of the litigation, and
6 serve the ends of justice, a protective order for such information is justified in this
7 matter. It is the intent of the parties that information will not be designated as
8 confidential for tactical reasons and that nothing be so designated without a good
9 faith belief that it has been maintained in a confidential, non-public manner, and
10 there is good cause why it should not be part of the public record of this case.

11 This case involves police use of excessive force. Discovery in this action is
12 likely to involve the production of sensitive, confidential documents pertaining to
13 and contained in the private employment personnel file of the Defendant CCPD
14 officers, which include Officer Diego Duran Jara and Officer Matthew Morgan
15 (collectively herein “Defendant Officers”). Production and disclosure of these
16 confidential personnel file documents without this protective order will subject
17 Defendant Officers to unwarranted and unnecessary embarrassment, harassment,
18 and/or violation of Defendant Officers’ right of privacy.

19 Accordingly, to expedite the flow of information, to facilitate the prompt
20 resolution of disputes over confidentiality of discovery materials, to adequately
21 protect information the parties are entitled to keep confidential, to ensure that the
22 parties are permitted reasonable necessary uses of such material in preparation for
23 and in the conduct of trial, to address their handling at the end of the litigation, and
24 serve the ends of justice, a protective order for such information is justified in this
25 matter. It is the intent of the parties that information will not be designated as
26 confidential for tactical reasons and that nothing be so designated without a good
27 faith belief that it has been maintained in a confidential, non-public manner, and
28 there is good cause why it should not be part of the public record of this case.

2. DEFINITIONS

2.1 Action: This pending federal lawsuit.

2.2 Challenging Party: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation of information or items under this Order.

2.3 “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: information (regardless of how it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c), and as specified above in the Good Cause Statement.

2.4 Counsel: Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well as their support staff).

2.5 Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as “CONFIDENTIAL.”

2.6 Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless of the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including, among other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or generated in disclosures or responses to discovery in this matter.

2.7 Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as an expert witness or as a consultant in this Action.

2.8 House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a party to this Action. House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside counsel.

2.9 Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.

2.10 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a party to this Action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this Action and

1 have appeared in this Action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm
2 which has appeared on behalf of that party, and includes support staff.

3 2.11 Party: any party to this Action, including all of its officers, directors,
4 employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their
5 support staffs).

6 2.12 Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or
7 Discovery Material in this Action.

8 2.13 Professional Vendors: persons or entities that provide litigation
9 support services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or
10 demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium)
11 and their employees and subcontractors.

12 2.14 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is
13 designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.”

14 2.15 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery
15 Material from a Producing Party.

16 3. SCOPE

17 The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only
18 Protected Material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or
19 extracted from Protected Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or
20 compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony, conversations, or
21 presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material.

22 Any use of Protected Material at trial will be governed by the orders of the
23 trial judge. This Order does not govern the use of Protected Material at trial.

24 4. DURATION

25 FINAL DISPOSITION of the action is defined as the conclusion of any
26 appellate proceedings, of if no appeal is taken, when the time for filing of an appeal
27 has run. Except as set forth below, the terms of this protective order apply through
28 FINAL DISPOSITION of the action. The parties may stipulate that they will be

1 contractually bound by the terms of this agreement beyond FINAL DISPOSITION
2 but will have to file a separate action for enforcement of the agreement once all
3 proceedings in this case are complete.

4 Once a case proceeds to trial, all of the information that was designated as
5 confidential or maintained pursuant to this protective order becomes public and will
6 be presumptively available to all members of the public, including the press, unless
7 compelling reasons supported by specific factual findings to proceed otherwise are
8 made to the trial judge in advance of the trial. See Kamakana v. City and County of
9 Honolulu, 447 F.3d 1172, 1180-81 (9th Cir. 2006) (distinguishing “good cause”
10 showing for sealing documents produced in discovery from “compelling reasons”
11 standard when merits-related documents are part of court record). Accordingly, the
12 terms of this protective order do not extend beyond the commencement of the trial.

13 5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

14 5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection.

15 Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under
16 this Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that
17 qualifies under the appropriate standards. The Designating Party must designate for
18 protection only those parts of material, documents, items, or oral or written
19 communications that qualify so that other portions of the material, documents,
20 items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept
21 unjustifiably within the ambit of this Order.

22 Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations
23 that are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper
24 purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily encumber the case development process or to impose
25 unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Designating
26 Party to sanctions.

1 If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it
2 designated for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must
3 promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing the inapplicable designation.

4 5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations. Except as otherwise provided in
5 this Order (see, e.g., second paragraph of section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise
6 stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection
7 under this Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or
8 produced.

9 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

10 (a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic documents,
11 but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), that
12 the Producing Party affix at a minimum, the legend "CONFIDENTIAL" (hereinafter
13 "CONFIDENTIAL legend"), to each page that contains protected material. If only a
14 portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing
15 Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate
16 markings in the margins).

17 A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents available for
18 inspection need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has
19 indicated which documents it would like copied and produced. During the
20 inspection and before the designation, all of the material made available for
21 inspection will be deemed "CONFIDENTIAL." After the inspecting Party has
22 identified the documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must
23 determine which documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this
24 Order. Then, before producing the specified documents, the Producing Party must
25 affix the "CONFIDENTIAL legend" to each page that contains Protected Material.
26 If only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the
27 Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making
28 appropriate markings in the margins).

(b) for testimony given in depositions that the Designating Party identify the Disclosure or Discovery Material on the record, before the close of the deposition all protected testimony.

(c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and for any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the exterior of the container or containers in which the information is stored the legend “CONFIDENTIAL.” If only a portion or portions of the information warrants protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, will identify the protected portion(s).

5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate. If timely corrected, an inadvertent failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the Designating Party’s right to secure protection under this Order for such material. Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the provisions of this Order.

6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

6.1 Timing of Challenges. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a designation of confidentiality at any time that is consistent with the Court’s Scheduling Order.

6.2 Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party will initiate the dispute resolution process (and, if necessary, file a discovery motion) under Local Rule 37.1 et seq.

6.3 The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding will be on the Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper purpose (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the Designating Party has waived or withdrawn the confidentiality designation, all parties will continue to afford the material in question the level of protection to which it is

entitled under the Producing Party's designation until the Court rules on the challenge.

7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

7.1 Basic Principles. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this Action only for prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this Action. Such Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the conditions described in this Order. When the Action has been terminated, a Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL DISPOSITION).

Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons authorized under this Order.

7.2 Disclosure of "CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items. Unless otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated "CONFIDENTIAL" only to:

(a) the Receiving Party's Outside Counsel of Record in this Action, as well as employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the information for this Action;

(b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action;

(c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" (Exhibit A);

(d) the Court and its personnel;

(e) court reporters and their staff;

(f) professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and Professional Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);

(g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information;

(h) during their depositions, witnesses, and attorneys for witnesses, in the Action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary provided: (1) the deposing party requests that the witness sign the form attached as Exhibit A hereto; and (2) they will not be permitted to keep any confidential information unless they sign the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A), unless otherwise agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material may be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order; and

(i) any mediator or settlement officer, and their supporting personnel, mutually agreed upon by any of the parties engaged in settlement discussions.

8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN OTHER LITIGATION

If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this Action as “CONFIDENTIAL,” that Party must:

(a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification will include a copy of the subpoena or court order;

(b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or order is subject to this Protective Order. Such notification will include a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order; and

(c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with the subpoena or court order will not produce any information designated in this action as “CONFIDENTIAL” before a determination by the court from which the subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party’s permission. The Designating Party will bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in that court of its confidential material and nothing in these provisions should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this Action to disobey a lawful directive from another court.

9. A NON-PARTY’S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE PRODUCED IN THIS LITIGATION

(a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a Non-Party in this Action and designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.” Such information produced by Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is protected by the remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions should be construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.

(b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to produce a Non-Party’s confidential information in its possession, and the Party is subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party’s confidential information, then the Party will:

(1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party that some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality agreement with a Non-Party;

(2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated Protective Order in this Action, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably specific description of the information requested; and

(3) make the information requested available for inspection by the Non-Party, if requested.

(c) If the Non-Party fails to seek a protective order from this court within 14 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party may produce the Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party will not produce any information in its possession or control that is subject to the confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by the court. Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party will bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in this court of its Protected Material.

10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this Order, and (d) request such person or persons to execute the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound" that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

11. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE PROTECTED MATERIAL

When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for production without prior privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar as the parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a

1 communication or information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work
2 product protection, the parties may incorporate their agreement in the stipulated
3 protective order submitted to the court.

4 12. MISCELLANEOUS

5 12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any
6 person to seek its modification by the Court in the future.

7 12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this
8 Protective Order no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to
9 disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in this
10 Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any
11 ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective Order.

12 12.3 Filing Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any
13 Protected Material must comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5. Protected Material may
14 only be filed under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the
15 specific Protected Material at issue. If a Party's request to file Protected Material
16 under seal is denied by the court, then the Receiving Party may file the information
17 in the public record unless otherwise instructed by the court.

18 13. FINAL DISPOSITION

19 After the final disposition of this Action, as defined in paragraph 4, within 60
20 days of a written request by the Designating Party, each Receiving Party must return
21 all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material. As used in
22 this subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies, abstracts, compilations,
23 summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected
24 Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving
25 Party must submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same
26 person or entity, to the Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that (1) identifies
27 (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned or
28 destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any copies,

1 abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or capturing any
2 of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled to
3 retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition, and hearing
4 transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert
5 reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert work product, even if such
6 materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival copies that contain or
7 constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective Order as set forth in
8 Section 4 (DURATION).

9 14. Any willful violation of this Order may be punished by civil or criminal
10 contempt proceedings, financial or evidentiary sanctions, reference to disciplinary
11 authorities, or other appropriate action at the discretion of the Court.

12
13 FOR GOOD CAUSE SHOWN BY THE PARTIES' STIPULATION, IT IS SO
14 ORDERED.

15
16
17 DATED: January 29, 2024


18 
19 HON. PEDRO V. CASTILLO
20 United States Magistrate Judge
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28

EXHIBIT AACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

I, _____ **[full name]**, of _____ **[full address]**, declare under penalty of perjury that I have read in its entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that was issued by the United States District Court for the Central District of California on [date] in the case of _____ **[insert case name and number]**. I agree to comply with and to be bound by all the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order and I understand and acknowledge that failure to so comply could expose me to sanctions and punishment in the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I will not disclose in any manner any information or item that is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order to any person or entity except in strict compliance with the provisions of this Order.

I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for the Central District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after termination of this action. I hereby appoint _____ **[full name]** of _____ **[full address and telephone number]** as my California agent for service of process in connection with this action or any proceedings related to enforcement of this Stipulated Protective Order.

Date: _____

City and State where signed: _____

Printed name: _____

Signature: _____